

# Equitable Access to an Excellent Education

Kelli Hopkins

Missouri School Boards' Association

May, 2016



# Equity

- ✧ Educational equity is the concept that all students should have access to the same quality of instruction regardless of their zip code.
- ✧ At the LEA level, educational equity means that all students in the LEA have access to the same quality of instruction regardless of the school they attend.



# Equity

- ✧ Focus: Equitable access to excellent educators
- ✧ Other aspects of equity
  - Equitable application of discipline
  - Equitable supports
  - Equitable facilities and supplies



# Origin Story

- ✧ Missouri Department of Elementary and Secondary Education (DESE) developed an equity plan
  - Included representatives from education-related groups
  - Based in part on ESEA waiver
  - Now part of ESSA



# Origin Story

- ✧ DESE requested our organization approach the issue from the board perspective.
- ✧ I was charged with creating a proposal and developing a practice to help school boards perform a self-evaluation.
- ✧ Pilot in two weeks



# ESSA

- ✧ Section 1111(g)(1)(B) requires SEA Title I plans to include a description of how the state will remedy situations where low-income and minority students are served by “ineffective, out-of-field or inexperienced teachers.”
- ✧ Section 1111(g)(2)(A) requires the SEA to develop and publicize a way to determine teacher effectiveness in order to fulfill requirements of 1111(g)(1)(B).



# ESSA

- ✦ Section 1112(b)(2)&(3) requires LEAs to have similar provisions in their plans.



# Problems

- ✧ Initial DESE work focused on comparing LEAs in the following groups:
- ✧ High-poverty as compared to low-poverty
- ✧ High-minority as compared to low-minority
- ✧ Rural as compared to non-rural





# Problems

- ✧ At least 351 schools in Missouri are rural under the definition used by DESE
- ✧ Including charters, MO has 562 LEAs
  - 28% have enrollment of 250 or fewer K-12
  - 47% have enrollment of 500 or fewer K-12
  - 70% have enrollment of 1000 or fewer K-12
- ✧ Many LEAs have so few minority students that a statistically meaningful cell size is impossible.
  - Most high-minority schools are located in fewer than 20 LEAs.



# Adjustments

- ✧ No set definition for high-minority or high poverty
- ✧ Did not define low-minority or low-poverty
- ✧ Offered an option for comparison between classes at the building level



# Problem

✧ No set definition for “effective” teachers



# Adjustment

- ✧ Compared data based on number of
  - First-year teachers
  - Tenured teachers
  - Teachers without full certification
  - Teachers teaching outside the area of certification
  - Teachers with extra-duties
- ✧ Collected, but did not compare first-year teachers without mentors



# Problem

- ✧ Few districts in Missouri engage in bargaining.
- ✧ Even fewer districts have written agreements.



# Adjustment

- ✧ Did not include an analysis of collectively bargained agreements



# Proposal

- ✧ Define the problem (in Missouri)
    - Rural, high poverty and high minority LEAs have:
      - More first year teachers
      - Low retention
      - Fewer mentors
      - Lower pay
    - Lack of high quality and diverse teacher candidates
    - Lack of preparation
    - Students more likely to face discipline
- Policies and practices contribute to inequity



# Proposal

- ✧ Define the board's role
  - Policy
  - Budget
  - District professional development plan
  - Hiring





# Proposal

- ✧ Create process for self-evaluation
  1. Collect data
  2. Apply the data
  3. Compare schools based on the data
  4. Analyze the data
  5. Apply the findings of the data



# Organizing Data

- ✧ Created a spreadsheet for use in this presentation
- ✧ A colleague who grooves on Excel is working on more robust and user-friendly version with formulas and other fancy stuff.



# Our Plan

- ✧ Once complete, MSBA will make this tool available to our member districts for use in evaluating their districts.
- ✧ DESE will promote the tool.
- ✧ Both DESE and MSBA will answer questions and provide support.
- ✧ MSBA is exploring a fee-based assistance option for on-site assistance.





## Promoting Equitable Access to Effective Teaching

This is a proposal for MSBA involvement in assisting the Missouri Department of Elementary and Secondary Education (DESE) in completing next steps in implementing the Missouri plan to ensure that students in the state have equitable access to excellent educators. There is no one definition of effective teacher. However, research provides some glimpses into effectiveness. For example:

- Experienced teachers tend to be more effective than new teachers, although the difference is not linear.
- New teachers with effective mentoring are more effective than new teachers with no or poor mentoring.
- Regular classroom teachers are more effective than substitutes.
- Teachers with full certification tend to be more effective than teachers with less than full certification.
- Teachers teaching within the area of certification tend to be more effective than those teaching outside their area of certification.

### Background: The Missouri Plan

The Missouri Equity Plan is based on the principle that students in Missouri must have access to effective teachers in every school, grade and content area and effective leaders that help guide those effective teachers. Unfortunately, data shows that students of color, students from low-income families, rural students, students with disabilities, students with limited English proficiency and students who are struggling academically are less likely than their peers to have such access. Missouri's equity plan has identified several potential "root causes" of inequity in Missouri schools.

- There is a shortage of high-quality and diverse candidates for teacher preparation programs.
- Teachers who are not fully qualified or who are teaching outside of their area of certification are more prevalent in schools with high numbers of students in poverty and minority students.
- On average, rural, high-minority and high-poverty schools are more likely to have less experienced teachers and students in those schools are far more likely to be taught by a first year teacher. First year principals are also more common.
- Teacher retention rates are lower in rural, high-minority and high-poverty schools.
- New teachers in high-poverty and high-minority schools are far less likely to have mentor.
- Surveys of first-year teachers and their principals indicate that teachers were less prepared to work with students in high-poverty and high-minority schools.
- Even accounting for the cost of living, teachers in high-poverty and rural schools are paid less than their counterparts in low-poverty and non-rural schools. The pay gap is smaller in the first year but increases significantly around year six.
- Students in high-minority secondary schools were more likely to face disciplinary consequences than those in low-poverty secondary schools.

- Policies and practices of schools and school districts contribute to inequity.

#### Next Steps and MSBA's Role

The plan identifies several next steps for Missouri in our efforts to ensure its students have equitable access to excellent educators. One of those is to examine and revise existing policies and practices at the district, and perhaps the building level, to ensure that they do not inadvertently limit access to quality educational opportunities for any population of students or exclude any students. MSBA believes that boards of education can play a key role in ensuring that students in their districts have access to excellent teachers and leaders through their governing documents.

- **Board Policy:** Policy, adopted by the board, should reflect the board's commitment to equity.
- **Professional Development Plan:** While personnel decisions are the responsibility of the superintendent and his or her administrative team, the board must clearly communicate their expectations concerning the quality of personnel hired and their professional development.
- **Budget:** The budget adopted by the board must support measures to ensure equity. This does not necessarily require the district to spend more money. Instead, the budget should be reviewed to ensure that spending is prioritized in a way to support equity.

In addition to its governing documents, other actions taken by the board may impact equity as well. For example, the board may, through collective bargaining or a meet and confer process, inadvertently create inequity by limiting the administration's ability to assign staff in a way that best serves the district and its students.

### **Directions: The following are directions to assist school districts in their analysis of policies and practices that may foster inequity.**

#### **Step 1: Collect Data**

Gather basic data on schools, teachers and students that will be pertinent to evaluating equity within the district. The district should be able to complete this step using data the district already has or can get from DESE. The district can choose whether to use one year of data or multiple years. MSBA recommends organizing the collected information in a spreadsheet. See the attached example.

##### A. Designate schools in the district as:

1. High-poverty based on the percentage of Free and Reduced Price Lunch (FRPL) students who attend the school as compared to the percentage of FRPL students in other comparable schools.
2. High-minority based on the percentage of non-white students, including Hispanic students, who attend the school as compared to the percentage of minority students in other comparable schools.

3. Rural (schools that are at least 25 miles from an area with a population of 50,000 or more and also at least ten miles from an area with a population of 25,000 – 50,000) (315 schools in Missouri are in this group).

*Notes:*

*Schools may have more than one designation.*

*The point of this exercise is to compare schools in the district that teach roughly the same age students but are unequal as to the number of minority students or students in poverty or are located in a rural setting. If there is no meaningful differentiation between schools in the district, for example if all schools are considered rural or all have similar numbers of minority or impoverished students, the comparison may not be meaningful.*

*When determining which schools are “high” minority or poverty, look for statistical separation. For example, if three elementary schools have less than 30% FRPL students, but one has 40% and one has 60%, comparatively the school with 60% would be “high” as compared to the other schools. It would be up to the district to determine if the school with 40% constituted a “high” number.*

*If all schools in the district are similar so that all or none are high poverty, high minority or all or none are rural, the district may apply this analysis on a building level. For example, in each school, the district can compare data for each class in a subject area or grade level.*

B. Identify teacher characteristics:

1. The percentage of teachers who:
  - a. Are first-year teachers
  - b. Have provisional or temporary certificates
  - c. Are fully certified, but teaching outside the area of certification
  - d. Are tenured
2. Create a list of:
  - a. Teachers with assigned extra duties (paid and unpaid) including a specific list of the assigned duties
  - b. First and second year teachers who have mentors
  - c. First and second year teachers who do not have mentors
3. Calculate the aggregate number of leave days taken by teachers in each school (other than leave for professional development).

*Notes:*

*Not all of this information will be included on the spreadsheet, but collect the data anyway as it will be useful for other types of data analysis.*

C. Identify student characteristics:

1. The number and percentage of long-term (more than ten consecutive days) suspensions assigned to students in each school
2. The number and percentage of students scoring at or above proficiency on the MAP English/language arts assessment at all grade levels in which the assessment is administered
3. The number and percentage of students scoring at or above proficiency on the MAP mathematics assessment at all grade levels in which the assessment is administered
4. The number and percentage of students scoring at or above proficiency on the Algebra I EOC assessment
5. The number and percentage of students scoring at or above proficiency on the EOC English II assessment
6. The number of students taking the ACT
7. The average ACT score of students

## **Step 2: Apply the Data**

Using the data collected above answer the following questions applicable to district schools.

### First-year teachers

How many and what percentage of first year teachers work in high-minority schools?

How many and what percentage of first year teachers work in high-poverty schools?

How many and what percentage of first year teachers work in rural schools?

How many and what percentage of first year teachers have a mentor?

How many and what percentage of first year teachers have an assigned extra duty?

### Certification

How many and what percentage of teachers with provisional or temporary certificates work in high-minority schools?

How many and what percentage of teachers with provisional or temporary certificates work in high-poverty schools?

How many and what percentage of teachers with provisional or temporary certificates work in rural schools?

How many and what percentage of teachers teaching outside their field of certification work in high-minority schools?

How many and what percentage of teachers teaching outside their field of certification work in high-poverty schools?



How many and what percentage of teachers teaching outside their field of certification work in rural schools?

#### Experience

How many and what percentage of tenured teachers work in high-minority schools?

How many and what percentage of tenured teachers work in high-poverty schools?

How many and what percentage of tenured teachers work in rural schools?

#### Leave

What was the average number of leave days, other than leave for professional development, taken by teachers in high-minority schools?

What was the average number of leave days, other than leave for professional development, taken by teachers in high-poverty schools?

What was the average number of leave days, other than leave for professional development, taken by teachers in rural schools?

### **Step 3 – Compare Schools Based on the Data**

For every school identified as high minority, high poverty or rural, compare the following:

The number and percentage of first-year teachers in those schools as compared to schools that have lower rates of poverty, lower numbers of minority students or are not rural.

The number and percentage of tenured teachers in those schools as compared to schools that have lower rates of poverty, lower numbers of minority students or are not rural.

The number and percentage of teachers with one or more extra duties in those schools as compared to schools that have lower rates of poverty, lower numbers of minority students or are not rural

The number and percentage of teachers with provisional or temporary certificates in those schools as compared to schools that have lower rates of poverty, lower numbers of minority students or are not rural.

The number and percentage of teachers teaching outside of their area of certification in those schools as compared to schools that have lower rates of poverty, lower numbers of minority students or are not rural.

The number of students taking the ACT in those schools as compared to schools that have lower rates of poverty, lower numbers of minority students or are not rural.

The average ACT score in those schools as compared to schools that have lower rates of poverty, lower numbers of minority students or are not rural.

The number and percentage of students scoring at or above proficiency on the MAP English/language arts assessment at all grade levels in which the assessment is administered as compared to schools that have lower rates of poverty, lower numbers of minority students or are not rural.

The number and percentage of students scoring at or above proficiency on the MAP mathematics assessment at all grade levels in which the assessment is administered as compared to schools that have lower rates of poverty, lower numbers of minority students or are not rural.

The number and percentage of students scoring at or above proficiency on the EOC Algebra I assessment as compared to schools that have lower rates of poverty, lower numbers of minority students or are not rural.

The number and percentage of students scoring at or above proficiency on the EOC English II assessment as compared to schools that have lower rates of poverty, lower numbers of minority students or are not rural.

The number and percentage of students suspended for more than ten consecutive days in grades K-8 in those schools as compared to schools that have lower rates of poverty, lower numbers of minority students or are not rural.

The number and percentage of students suspended for more than ten consecutive days in grades K-8 in those schools as compared to schools that have lower rates of poverty, lower numbers of minority students or are not rural.

The percentage of first year teachers with extra duty assignments as compared to tenured teachers.

#### **Step 4: Analyze**

Using the answers to the questions above, determine if any of the following statements are true. Instead of addressing high-minority, high-poverty and rural schools together, the district may choose to break each question into three parts.

The district has more first year teachers in high-minority, high-poverty and rural schools than in schools that have lower rates of poverty, lower numbers of minority students or are not rural.

The district has more temporary or provisionally certified teachers in high-minority, high-poverty and rural schools than in schools that have lower rates of poverty, lower numbers of minority students or are not rural.

The district has more teachers teaching outside of their area of certification in high-minority, high-poverty and rural schools than in schools that have lower rates of poverty, lower numbers of minority students or are not rural.

The district has fewer tenured teachers in high-minority, high-poverty and rural schools than in schools that have lower rates of poverty, lower numbers of minority students or are not rural.

Teachers in high-minority, high-poverty and rural schools take more leave than those in schools that have lower rates of poverty, lower numbers of minority students or are not rural.

Teachers in high-minority, high-poverty and rural schools have more assigned extra-duty than teachers in schools that have lower rates of poverty, lower numbers of minority students or are not rural.

Fewer students in high-minority, high-poverty and rural schools score at proficient or above on the MAP English/language arts assessment in third grade than students in schools that have lower rates of poverty, lower numbers of minority students or are not rural.

Fewer students in high-minority, high-poverty and rural schools score at proficient or above on the MAP English/language arts assessment in fourth grade than students in schools that have lower rates of poverty, lower numbers of minority students or are not rural.

Fewer students in high-minority, high-poverty and rural schools score at proficient or above on the MAP English/language arts assessment in fifth grade than students in schools that have lower rates of poverty, lower numbers of minority students or are not rural.

Fewer students in high-minority, high-poverty and rural schools score at proficient or above on the MAP English/language arts assessment in sixth grade than students in schools that have lower rates of poverty, lower numbers of minority students or are not rural.

Fewer students in high-minority, high-poverty and rural schools score at proficient or above on the MAP English/language arts assessment in seventh grade than students in schools that have lower rates of poverty, lower numbers of minority students or are not rural.

Fewer students in high-minority, high-poverty and rural schools score at proficient or above on the MAP English/language arts assessment in eighth grade than students in schools that have lower rates of poverty, lower numbers of minority students or are not rural.

Fewer students in high-minority, high-poverty and rural schools score at proficient or above on the MAP mathematics assessment in third grade than students in schools that have lower rates of poverty, lower numbers of minority students or are not rural.

Fewer students in high-minority, high-poverty and rural schools score at proficient or above on the MAP mathematics assessment in fourth grade than students in schools that have lower rates of poverty, lower numbers of minority students or are not rural.

Fewer students in high-minority, high-poverty and rural schools score at proficient or above on the MAP mathematics assessment in fifth grade than students in schools that have lower rates of poverty, lower numbers of minority students or are not rural.

Fewer students in high-minority, high-poverty and rural schools score at proficient or above on the MAP mathematics assessment in sixth grade than students in schools that have lower rates of poverty, lower numbers of minority students or are not rural.

Fewer students in high-minority, high-poverty and rural schools score at proficient or above on the MAP mathematics assessment in seventh grade than students in schools that have lower rates of poverty, lower numbers of minority students or are not rural.

Fewer students in high-minority, high-poverty and rural schools score at proficient or above on the MAP mathematics assessment in eighth grade than students in schools that have lower rates of poverty, lower numbers of minority students or are not rural.

Fewer students in high-minority, high-poverty and rural schools score at proficient or above on the MAP EOC Algebra I assessment than students in schools that have lower rates of poverty, lower numbers of minority students or are not rural.

Fewer students in high-minority, high-poverty and rural schools score at proficient or above on the MAP EOC English II assessment than students in schools that have lower rates of poverty, lower numbers of minority students or are not rural.

Fewer students in high-minority, high-poverty and rural schools take the ACT than students in schools that have lower rates of poverty, lower numbers of minority students or are not rural.

Students in high-minority, high-poverty and rural schools have an average ACT score lower than students in schools that have lower rates of poverty, lower numbers of minority students or are not rural.

### **Step 5: Apply the Findings**

If any of the above statements are true, the board must:

1. Determine if the difference is large enough to warrant further investigation.
2. Determine if there is potentially an impact on measures of student achievement. For example, if the district finds that teachers in rural schools use more leave than teachers in non-rural schools and that students in those schools do not perform as well on required testing, that would seem to support the theory that regular teachers are more effective than substitutes.
3. Determine the reason(s) why there is a difference. Using the example above, the district would need to examine why more leave is taken by teachers in rural schools as opposed to those in non-rural schools. Perhaps the school is isolated enough that simple tasks, such as medical appointments, require the teachers in those schools to miss more hours of instruction due to travel time. Perhaps the school environment is such that teachers do not look forward to coming to work. Perhaps the leave policy is administered more liberally in those schools.

4. Identify potential solutions.

*Notes: The district may use other techniques such as surveys or focus groups to further analyze the data it collected. In addition the district may determine that more data is required or that the current data needs further disaggregation.*

## **Options**

The district may also choose to **collect, apply, compare and analyze** other data such as student growth, graduation rates, student attendance rates, incidents of violence (fighting and assault), progress and proficiency of English learners and progress and proficiency of special education students

## **Conclusion**

All school boards want the students in their district to receive the same quality of education regardless of the school they attend or the teacher they have. Completing this exercise is a good way to start the conversation about whether this is the case in your district.